Your child, your choice

If you choose the wrong child car seat or make mistakes installing it, your child could pay a very high price if you have a crash. Our research will set you right.

Buying the right car seat is the most important travel decision you’ll make for your child. But for most parents, the array of brightly coloured seats presented by retailers causes a dilemma. They all meet the legal minimum standard, and they all look jazzy and cool. So how on earth are you supposed to know which one works best – in normal use or, in a worst case scenario, protecting your child if you have a crash?

Of course, it doesn’t end there. Once you’ve purchased your child’s seat, it can only protect your child effectively if it’s installed correctly.

To help you, we’ve put the latest batch of car seats through our rigorous test programme. We’ve also talked to people whose job it is to advise parents on choosing and using seats. And we take a look at why rear-facing seats for older children might be a way of keeping them safer in cars (see p59).

Trust Which?

Our research into child car seats is second to none. We put every seat we test through the most rigorous crash testing regime available, including front and side crashes equivalent to those used in tests on car safety for adults.

We also carry out detailed ease-of-use assessments on every seat, in every mode the maker claims it can be used in. And we do this in a range of mass-market family cars, from superminis to MPVs.

To help you to understand how best to make sure of your child’s safety in transit, we also investigate current best practice and the direction for future designs.

Finally, we unravel all the flowery language so that parents and carers can feel confident that they will choose the right seat for their baby or child.

We’ve added all our findings to our database of previously tested seats. Go online to www.which.co.uk/childseats for more information.

How we test

We test what happens in a 40mph front crash or a smash from the side – this is more realistic than the minimum legal requirements.

Our crash tests are derived from Euro NCAP – it carries out crash testing on behalf of European consumers and shows how well cars protect occupants in severe accidents.

Our testing is similar for child seats and more accurately reflects what happens in real crashes than the legal minimum requirement for child seats (ECE R44/04), which uses much lower loads and doesn’t include a side-impact test.

We propel a Vauxhall Astra car body down a track, stopping it sharply and filming the effects on the dummy in the seat.

Our dummies are wired up to record the head, neck, chest and pelvic loads, accurately indicating what chances a real child would have in similar circumstances.

Easy is essential

Another omission from the legal requirements are ease-of-use tests.

We check how easy the instructions are to understand and whether a seat’s easy to install and adjust in a range of cars.

A seat that’s difficult to install is more likely to be incorrectly fitted, which could increase the risk of injury or even death in a crash. Go to www.which.co.uk/childseats to see film footage of our tests.

A poorly installed seat could result in a child’s serious injury or death

- Have at least one go at installing before purchasing, preferably with help from an expert.
- Examine the seat and thoroughly read the instructions before taking it to your car. Always follow the manufacturer’s instructions and keep them with the seat.
- Carry children in a back car seat if you can.
- Never fit a rear-facing seat in front of an active airbag. If it goes off, the force could kill your child.
- The seat should have minimal forward or sideways movement. When you open the buckle of the adult belt, the seat should spring upwards slightly.
- Only the seat belt webbing should touch the child seat frame, not the buckle. Otherwise pressure on the buckle could make it fail.
- Never modify a seat in any way.

Expert help

Installing a seat for the first time is rarely straightforward and it seems even trickier once you get home.

In Bromley, Kent, the council’s child car seat centre advises parents and retailers on installing car seats. We visited the centre to find out more.

‘It’s important to make sure every seat is correctly installed. There should be no movement,’ said Val Fuller, Child Car Seat Education Officer. ‘The advice we offer to parents in the child car seat centre and our Transport for London-funded training scheme for retailers is aimed at improving safety for all children travelling in our area.’

We sat in on a training session at retailer Baby Baby in West Wickham. It was training staff to a basic level of
Val Fuller, left, trains staff at a local shop

Most local authorities offer installation advice, but not on the scale of Bromley or Essex

competence to advise about weight groups, moving babies from one stage to the next, airbags, harness adjustment, Isofix and the law. Most child-seat retailers in Bromley display certificates, so you can ask for the qualified person in each store.

Bromley and Essex are the only two councils we know of that have these centres, and they welcome all parents. But if you don’t live nearby, contact your own local authority. Most offer advice, either from road safety officers or traffic police officers.

Which? says
To improve the chances of all children in crashes, we’d like to see schemes like Bromley’s rolled out across the country.

1/3 GROUP 0+

79% Mothercare Meteor £190
(Isofix); 74% £90 (Belted)
You can buy this seat with an Isofix base (see ‘Try before you buy’, p58, for more about Isofix) or use it on its own, secured by a car seat belt. It performs best in Isofix mode, although the support leg of the Isofix base can be used only in cars with an appropriate floor design (car-compatibility details are on Mothercare’s website – see ‘Contacts’, p60).

It’s a top performer for safety and ease of use, but has slightly limited visibility for the child. The belted installation isn’t quite as effective in our safety tests, but is still good enough to achieve Best Buy status. It’s only available at Mothercare.

WE LIKE It’s very easy to install — especially when used with an Isofix base.

Available Mothercare Suitable child weight Up to 13kg Travel system n/a

2 GROUP 0+

77% Jané Strata £112
This infant carrier uses the adult belt to secure it in the car, and it’s slightly more difficult to fit than other Best Buys. However, once in place, the integral harness can be easily adjusted as your child grows. With many other seats you have to unthread the belts. It has one minor impracticality — to avoid potential injury, the handle has to be folded when the seat’s in the car. It’s cheapest online.

WE LIKE Its excellent head support.

Available Independents and online Suitable child weight Up to 13kg Travel system Jané Nomad, Slalom Pro, Aniversario, Powerwin Pro, Twin Two and Carrera Cup

3 GROUP 0+

72% Chicco Auto-fix Plus £100
This version of the Chicco seat is less convenient than the version with a base (7), as you can’t just secure the base using the seat belt and click the seat in and out. However, this model’s £20 cheaper and performs better. With the base, performance is still acceptable but it just misses our Best Buy rating. It’s cheapest online.

WORTH KNOWING This model has a poor-quality finish.

Available Independents and online Suitable child weight Up to 13kg Travel system Chicco Trio For Me, For Me Stroller, Tour 4 Trio and CTO.

4 GROUP 0+

70% Britax Explorer Isofix £230
This seat had excellent performance when used in Isofix mode (the belted version (17) isn’t a Best Buy). It does well in front and side impacts, is easy to install and adjust, and cleaning the cover is a doddle. It offers good leg support for your child, although their field of vision will be slightly restricted. At 13.4kg, it’s the heaviest Best Buy and is probably best left permanently in one car. It is cheapest at John Lewis.

WE LIKE Its very clear instructions and good performance.

Available Halfords, John Lewis, Mothercare, Toys R Us Suitable child weight 0-13kg Travel system n/a
20 GROUP 2/3

72% Cybex Solution X £110

This is a good-quality seat that scores highly for safety and is very easy to use, with the car’s three-point seat belt securing both seat and child. Its high back means it may be necessary to remove the car’s head restraints to ensure a snug installation against the car’s seat. But once the seat is in place, this will provide a very comfortable travel ride for your child. It’s cheapest at Mothercare.

WE DON’T LIKE The hand-wash only cover is hardly ideal for busy parents.

Available Independents and Mothercare Suitable child weight 15-36kg Travel system n/a

FREE CAR GUIDE

Don’t set foot in a showroom without it

Which? Car 2008 is the no-nonsense guide to buying new and used cars – it’s free with your next issue of Which?.

This essential guide features the results of our huge car reliability and satisfaction survey, plus our Best Buy cars for 2008.

OUR RESEARCH

When selecting products to test, we consult manufacturers, market intelligence reports and industry experts, then check availability on the high street and online. Tested models include top sellers from the most popular brands, products with innovative features, models from some lesser-known brands and widely available Best Buys from previous tests.

Test dummy

Mamas & Papas seat falls down in our tests

As with all the seats on test, the Mamas & Papas Teko (19) meets the current minimum legal requirements. It’s also well made, lightweight and has reasonably clear instructions, but these aren’t enough to save it from our ‘Don’t Buy’ recommendation.

For children over 25kg, Mamas & Papas recommends removing the backrest. This means the Teko fails to protect the child from high front and side crash loads. In a serious impact, this could lead to serious neck, chest and head injuries, or even death.

The instructions don’t aid the relatively complex belt routing, meaning incorrect installation is a higher likelihood than with many of the other seats in our test.

BEST BUY

Turning things around

Rear-seat campaigner Helena Atkinson and Eiris, aged 14 months

Try before you buy

Whether you’re a parent, grandparent, uncle or aunt, or just a friend, we’ll help you meet your legal obligation if you carry a child in your car.

Q I need to buy a child car seat. Where do I start?
A Choosing the right seat always starts with your child’s weight. This governs which seat you need to buy.

Group 0 0-10kg (from birth to about nine months)
Group 0+ 0-13kg (from birth to about 12 months)
Group 1 9-18kg (about nine months to four years)
Group 2 15-25kg (about four to six years)
Group 3 22-36kg (about six to 12 years)

Q Now I know the right weight category, how do I find the right seat for my child?
A Try the seats you are interested in in your car with your child. If it’s for an unborn baby, try them anyway. Don’t wait until the birth – unless you have a child car seat, most hospitals won’t discharge you if you’re driving home.

Preferably, get expert advice to help you understand how to install the seat and whether it fits your car properly. You might find help at a retailer, although in our experience the level of expertise available is very much hit and miss.

Bromley and Essex councils both offer expert help with choosing and using seats – see ‘A fitting message’, p56, for more, and to find out what to do if you don’t live near these areas.

Q Should I buy an Isofix-mounted seat, rather than a belted one?
A Isofix seats are generally easier to install – reducing the chance of misuse – as they just slot into place. If fitted correctly, they usually perform as well or better in a crash than the equivalent belt-fitted seat. But not all cars have Isofix mounts and not all Isofix seats fit in all cars with Isofix mounts. Get professional advice before you buy and try the seat in the car.
Research suggests Swedish children up to five years old fare better in car accidents than those in the UK. We explore why

In Europe, children up to 13kg (around a year old) generally travel rear facing. But in Sweden, authorities recommend that children are kept rear facing until they are at least four years old, and all seats initially have to be fitted by a professional. In the UK, rear-facing seats are hard to find and seats don’t have to be professionally fitted.

The graph, right, compares injuries suffered in cars by children under five. From age one, when most UK children change to forward-facing seats, Swedish children fare much better.

Helena Atkinson, from the campaign organisation Rear Facing: The Way Forward, wants to encourage parents to keep children rear facing for longer. She said: ‘Children are clearly safer rear facing. The problem is that UK parents are unaware these seats exist.

Manufacturers won’t make them available and people don’t know to ask for them.’

We showed the graph, right, to Farid Bendjellal, Technical Director at child-seat manufacturer Britax. He said that it doesn’t account for potential misuse and that in the UK, 60 to 80 per cent of seats are incorrectly installed.

When we asked Farid why his company sells rear-facing Group 1 seats in Sweden, but not the UK, he said: ‘There’s an agreed European standard, but Sweden has adopted separate practices.’ Farid added: ‘In a front impact, rear-facing seats usually protect well. But the complexity of straps and brackets required to ensure the seat is secure in rear impacts creates a unique installation in each model of car.’

A FAMILY AFFAIR

Best Buys under scrutiny – the Which? family try out two child car seats

Darren and Toni Jones and their children, Harriet (3) and Sam (5), tried two Best Buy child car seats (see Which?, June 2007, p70, and www.which.co.uk/carseats) and told us what they thought of them.

The instructions for the Britax Evolva 2/3 Isofit were in a drawer at the front of the seat – easy to find, easy to store.

But with the Britax Evolva 2/3 Ultra seat, they couldn’t find them anywhere. ‘We thought they were missing and struggled to install the seat from the pictorial guidance on it,’ Toni said.

The instructions turned out to be behind a panel underneath the seat – not obvious, difficult to access and, once located, hard to retrieve.

Both seats use the belt to secure the child, but the Joneses liked the simplicity of installing the Isofix version. Darren told us: ‘It stays in place even when there isn’t a child strapped in.’

The Joneses want to be able to recline the children’s car seats. ‘We’d like to be able to do it if one of the children falls asleep on the move,’ Toni said.

Reclining both seats was a struggle at first. In the end, almost by chance, Toni discovered that both recline when you tilt the adult seat back – simple, but probably not doable on the move.

(4) Turn to p40 to find out how our advice on buying a car saved the family £9,706.)
**Travel systems**

A one-stop travel package for your baby

A travel system pushchair can be used with a compatible car seat and/or carrycot that is designed to attach to the pushchair.

They let you easily transfer your baby between car, pushchair and home — great if you spend a lot of time on the move. But be aware that babies should not spend long periods of time in a child car seat.

Travel systems appear to be a bargain because they are flexible, but the pushchairs are often large and heavy and you need space to store parts you’re not using. Babies will outgrow the child car seat in around 12 months.

The Mamas & Papas Primo Sleep IP (9) is the only seat in this test that is compatible with a Best Buy pushchair, the Ziko Herbie. There are some Best Buy seats from our 2007 tests that match pushchairs. The Best Buy Maxi Cosi Cabrio seat is compatible with a wide range, including two Best Buys – the Bugaboo Bee and Quinny Speedi SX. The Best Buy Recaro Young Profi Plus is part of the Best Buy Maclaren Techno XLR travel system.

Go to www.which.co.uk/pushchairs and www.which.co.uk/childseats for more.

---

**MODEL** | **SPECIFICATION** | **PRICE (£)** | **TYPE** | **PART OF A TRAVEL SYSTEM** | **WEIGHT OF SEAT (kg)** | **FRONT CRASH**
---|---|---|---|---|---|---
**GROUP 0+: BIRTH TO 13kg**
1. MOTHERCARE Meteor[^a] | 190 | I | ✓ | 3.2 | ★★★★★
2. JANE Strata | 112 | B | ✓ | 4.4 | ★★★★★
3. MOTHERCARE Meteor | 90 | B | ✓ | 3.2 | ★★★★★
4. CHICCO Auto-fix Plus[^a] | 100 | B | ✓ | 3.8 | ★★★★★
5. HAUCK Zero Plus | 45 | B | ✓ | 2.9 | ★★★★★
6. BEBE CONFORT Babycoque Streety | 260 | B | ✓[^b] | 2.8 | ★★★★★
7. CHICCO Auto-fix Plus[^a] | 120 | B | ✓ | 3.8 | ★★★★★
8. SILVER CROSS Ventura Plus | 100 | B | ✓ | 3.9 | ★★★★★
9. MAMAS & PAPAS Pro-Sleep IP | 130 | B | ✓ | 5.9 | ★★★★★
10. MAMAS & PAPAS Primo Viaggio IP[^a] | 210 | B | ✓ | 5.1 | ★★★★★
11. MAMAS & PAPAS Primo Viaggio IP | 110 | B | ✓ | 5.1 | ★★★★★
12. MUTSY Safe 2 Go | 100 | B | ✓ | 4.3 | ★★★★★

**GROUP 1: CHILDREN 9kg TO 18kg**
13. BRITAX Explora Isofix | 230 | I | ✓ | 13.4 | ★★★★★
14. MAMAS & PAPAS Pro Tec Isofix | 230 | I | ✓ | 11.8 | ★★★★★
15. BEBE CONFORT Axiss | 180 | B | ✓ | 11 | ★★★★★
16. BRITAX Explora[^c] | 230 | B | ✓ | 13.4 | ★★★★★
17. MOTHERCARE Motion | 100 | B | ✓ | 7.1 | ★★★★★

**GROUP 1, 2, 3: CHILDREN 9kg TO 36kg**
18. NANNIA Beline SP | 50 | B | ✓ | 5.1 | ★★★★★
19. MAMAS & PAPAS Teko | 70 | B | ✓ | 5.9 | ★★★★★

**GROUP 2, 3: CHILDREN 15kg TO 36kg**
20. CYBEX Solution X | 110 | B | ✓ | 5.3 | ★★★★★
21. SILVER CROSS Navigator | 100 | B | ✓ | 6.6 | ★★★★★
22. JANE Indy Plus Team | 115 | I | ✓ | 6.7 | ★★★★★
23. NANNIA Dreamfix SP | 47 | B | ✓ | 4.7 | ★★★★★
24. RECARO Monza | 95 | B | ✓ | 5.2 | ★★★★★
25. MAMAS & PAPAS Pro-Gro | 95 | B | ✓ | 6.6 | ★★★★★

---

[^a]: With base[^b]: Available as part of the Streety travel system only – full system price quoted[^c]: This is the same seat as the Britax

**Using the table**

We tested latest models from leading brands.

The more stars the better.

**Specification**

**Price** For Best Buys, we give the cheapest, widely available high-street price. If we couldn’t find them at major high-street shops, we give the most common online price.

However, we advise against buying a child car seat online, as this usually doesn’t allow you to try the seat out first.

Prices for other models are a guide. **Type** B = belted; I = Isofix.

**Test performance**

We consider as many configurations as the manufacturer instructions recommend for each seat. We show the scores for the worst-case
mode of use for each seat. Front crash/Side crash
We simulated crashes with forces used in Euro NCAP car crash tests. These reflect what happens in serious front and side crashes. Overall crash safety Includes seat design, head support and stability of the child seat in the car seat, as well as front and side crash performance. A front, side or overall crash score of one star limits the total test score a model can achieve. We consider as many configurations as the manufacturer instructions recommend for each seat. We show the scores for the worst-case mode of use for each seat. Ease of use and comfort Includes how easily the belt threads through the seat and how easy it is to strap the child in securely.

Avoiding incorrect installation How well-designed the seat is to avoid inadvertent misuse. Incorrect installation could compromise seat performance in a crash.
Fitting in car How easy it is to install and adjust the seat correctly in a car.

Instructions How clear and comprehensible the instructions and labels that come with each seat are.
Score This ignores price and is based on:
Safety 60%
Ease of use 40%

SPECIAL OFFER
Make sure your baby gets the best
Written in a clear and accessible style, Baby and Toddler Essentials provides step-by-step advice on everything you need, including child car seats, feeding equipment, highchairs, safety guidelines, internet shopping and much more.


www.which.co.uk
June 2008 | 61